

## CLARIFICATION REQUESTS/RESPONSES

PRICE				
Serial Nr	IFB Section Ref.	BIDDERS QUESTION	NCI AGENCY ANSWER	Status*
P.1	Bidding Sheets	<p>Amendment 2 removes the Tempest pricing tab and inserts one column that requires a percentage of cost based on hardware value to be entered. Not only do we miss the level indication (A, B, C) in this column while the OSW still speaks about all three levels, plus with and without PLF, this also creates the following issue, while before the sheet was in fact fine to make an offer for:</p> <p>The TEMPEST modification and certification price is different for each piece of equipment, be it a keyboard or an LCD – in addition, the TEMPEST modification &amp; certification fee is totally different for Levels, A, B and C. The TEMPEST modification price bears no relationship to the "Notional total discounted price in EUR" of the commercial equipment and therefore cannot be described or bid as a percentage of the notional discounted price. The TEMPEST modification and certification fee is a finite price based on the modifications needed and the time to modify and then test in the TEMPEST chamber and not based on a fixed percentage of the commercial variant. The new pricing sheets with respect to TEMPEST are now impossible to complete.</p>	<p>Tempest levels A, B and C were never removed under the previous Amendment. For Schedules A and Schedule B, under the CLIN Item column is where the Tempesting Level has always been identified.</p> <p>For each item and each tempesting level, Bidders should know their tempesting price as <u>an absolute value</u>. In addition, Bidders should know their discounted unit price per COTS item (this is the backbone of the Bidder's offer, based on CLIN 1). Therefore, the Bidder would calculate the fixed tempesting percentage per item and per level, as follows:</p> <p><b>Fixed tempesting percentage = bidder's absolute price for tempesting the specific item at the specific level / bidder's discounted unit price for the COTS item to undergo tempesting</b></p> <p>As stated in Book I, the provided notional discounted values <b>serve for evaluation purposes only</b>. The Contract pricing will be based on the red formula above.</p> <p>Tempesting fixed percentage per unit on discounted price shall remain during the Period of Performance, and shall be applicable to the current minimum requirement configurations as outlined in SOW Annex A and any subsequent successor or replacement model for the specific configuration.</p>	CLOSED

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

P.2	Bidding Sheets	<p>We are critical of the change in bidding sheets for Tempest performance HP and Dell. At this stage, the percentages are based on the estimated purchase prices of the hardware. This does not seem logical to us. Tempest performance is a service that is not based on the prices of the hardware but is to be stated without context.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. We request that the linkage of the Tempest service be broken and queried independently.</li> <li>2. Likewise, we ask to query this service for the individual contract years, as with the engineering services.</li> <li>3. For each product another line should be added in the Bidding Sheets. We ask to add in each line the price position of the certification/re-certification.</li> </ol>	<p>Please see response for P.1.</p> <p>Engineering Services is indeed broken down by the Period of Performance as these are services being provided in which labour rates are calculated.</p> <p>As stated in AMD 2, P.2, initial certification shall include the "golden device" pricing embedded and shall not be separately priced. AMD 2 removed re-certification. The indicative quantities per item reflect historical information and aim to assist the Bidders to allocate the certification costs into "all-inclusive" tempesting unit prices; then, these unit prices will be converted to fixed percentages on the basis of the discounted GPL prices (see response for P.1).</p> <p>Regarding the tempesting service pricing through the individual years of the Contract, any future year's adjustment on the tempesting service unit price will be automatically taken into account, because the fixed percentage for tempesting will be applied on the escalated GPL prices -and after the applicable discount- of that future year.</p>	CLOSED
-----	----------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

P.3	Book I IFB-CO-115760-e-FIT AMD 2, page 16	<p>You Request in the document Book I IFB-CO-115760-e-FIT AMD 2 on page 16 under (I) B-12 Certificate of AQAP 2110 or ISO-9001: 2015 Compliance and on page 54 under ANNEX B-12 Certificate of AQAP 2110 or ISO-9001: 2015 Compliance.</p> <p>Are we correct in assuming that the TEMPEST Company must also be AQAP 2110 or ISO-9001: 2015 certified and must submit a copy of the certificate with the main supplier?</p>	<p>The Prospective Bidder shall submit certificate B12 Certificate if AQAP 2119 or ISO-9001: 2015 Compliance. Book I does not request any information to be submitted concerning the Tempesteing Company.</p> <p>In Book II Part IV SoW in Section 2.13 states:</p> <p>"The Contractor shall provide tempested equipment as identified in the SSS in accordance with the SDIP 27 appropriate level, including the certification corresponding to the specific tempest level (Level A, Level B or Level C). TEMPEST Testing must be by a NATO approved TEMPEST provider as listed on the NATO Information Assurance Product Catalogue:  <a href="https://www.ia.nato.int/niapc/Tempest">https://www.ia.nato.int/niapc/Tempest</a>  TEMPEST testing and certification must be performed on a per device basis. Batch testing will not be accepted. Each certified device must be delivered with the TEMPEST certificate".</p>	CLOSED

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

P. 4	Schedules A and B Tempest CLINS	<p>Regarding Schedules A and B Tempest CLINS: NATO has changed the pricing structure for TEMPEST with Amendment 2 and it is now a percentage of the commercial or notional discounted price. The TEMPEST modification and certification price is different for each piece of equipment, be it a router, switch, computer, keyboard, or an LCD – in addition, the TEMPEST modification &amp; certification fee is totally different for Levels, A, B and C. The TEMPEST modification price bears no relationship to the “Notional total discounted price in EUR” of the commercial equipment and therefore cannot be described or bid as a percentage of the notional discounted price.</p> <p>The TEMPEST modification and certification fee is a finite price based on the modifications needed and the time to modify and then test in the TEMPEST chamber and not based on a fixed percentage of the commercial variant.</p> <p>Can NATO revert to the fixed price approach of the original IFB and Amendment 1 or explain its rationale for the new discounted pricing approach?</p>	<p>NCIA has not changed the pricing structure. Please view the response for P.1.</p> <p>This requirement has always asked for Firm Fixed Discount Pricing per Book I. The Bidding Sheets were amended as the previous wording did not capture with clarity the intent of this requirement which is to be based on firm fixed discount pricing.</p> <p>Notional values have always been stated within Book I that these values <b><u>serve only for evaluation purposes.</u></b></p>	CLOSED
------	---------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

P.5	IFB-CO-115760-e-FIT Schedule Bidding Sheets AMD2	<p>In the price table "" the request for a "family" products is challenging. In order to calculate the TEMPEST prices, please indicate the specific models that will need to be TEMPEST certified for the following families: Catalyst 9000 Family, ISR4000 Family, ASR1000 Family. For example in the Catalyst 9000 series there' is a 9200, 9300, 9400, 9500, 9600 switch &amp; X"variants.</p> <p>If all products need to be certified this will be expensive. If NATO only intend to use a few of these switches then it will help if they were specifically identified together with a spec as per products in Schedule A.. It would be helpful to identify the specific models within the Nexus 9200, 9300 &amp; 9500 data center switch family.</p>	<p>Bidders shall view Annex A for tempesteing items. Tempesteing fixed percentage per unit on discounted price shall remain during the Period of Performance, and shall be applicable to the current minimum requirement configurations as outlined in <b>SOW Annex A</b> and any subsequent successor or replacement model for the specific configuration thereto.</p>	AMD 3
-----	--------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

P.6	AMD 2; SSS CLIN5 - TEMPESTING	<p>With regards to SSS CLIN 5 – TEMPESTING the bidder wants to highlight the following issues with the latest (AMD2) version of the pricing structure:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Expressing the TEMPEST pricing as a % of the discounted hardware prices makes the TEMPEST pricing variable. The TEMPEST pricing for the same device will be different depending not only the configuration of the device, but also the moment in time when the device is ordered.</li> <li>2. There is no direct link between the value of a device and the actual cost structure of TEMPEST activities. TEMPEST suppliers typically express the pricing of their services FIRM FIXED UNIT based, depending the required TEMPEST level and the type of device.</li> <li>3. It's unclear how the average base value of a device in the evaluation scenario has been determined, and which components (hardware, licences, maintenance services) are contributing to this value. This makes it highly risky to use these values as a baseline for expressing % based pricing for TEMPEST services.</li> <li>4. The actual average values used in the evaluation can be challenged – i.e. the average value of a 24 port switch and a 48 port switch are typically not the same, although the evaluation scenario uses for these categories the same value.</li> </ol> <p>The bidder is therefore asking the Agency to revert back to the original price model for TEMPEST, based on a FIRM FIX UNIT price per TEMPEST level and per family type. This will guarantee a stable, firm fixed and correct price for the TEMPEST services.</p>	<p>NCIA seeks to establish a firm fixed discount contract and not a firm fixed price contract (excluding engineering services and PHS&amp;T which shall be fixed). The discount percentage shall remain fixed during the life of the contract to include any successor/replacement models.</p> <p>See responses for P.1, P.2, P.4.</p>	CLOSED
-----	-------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------

NATO UNCLASSIFIED

## NATO UNCLASSIFIED

P.7	Bidding Sheets	<p>Based on the feedback from tempesteing company, the pricing of tempesteing services mainly depends on these 3 criteria: required tempest level (A, B, C), type of tempesteing item and its quantity. Regarding the table provided by NCIA the tempesteing price is calculated as a fixed percentage per unit on discounted price of particular CLIN.</p> <p>Therefore, we would kindly ask NCIA to reconsider this requirement to ensure required price realism. Could NCIA accept tempesteing pricing as a fixed unit price (€) per particular CLIN?</p>	Please see response P.1, and P.6	CLOSED
-----	----------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------	--------

## NATO UNCLASSIFIED